### Use of cost and economic evaluation evidence in policy brief development

Arash Rashidian, MD PhD Director of Science, Information and Dissemination WHO EMRO

Capacity Building for Development of Policy Briefs: Advanced Training of Trainers Workshop for Researchers and Policy-Developers



#### Session content

- WHO EMRO multi-concept approach to evidence-informed policy-making
- Key principles of economic evaluation studies
- Use of economic evaluation and Health Technology Assessment studies in policy brief development
  - $\circ~$  When and how to use them critical appraisal
  - Transferability of economic evaluation results to local context
  - Use of local cost data in selecting policy interventions
- Use of national cost data for estimating cost of policy implementation
  - Sources and validity of data
  - When to use cost data
- Presenting cost and cost-effectiveness data in a policy brief



### Framework for improving national institutional capacity for use of evidence in health policy-making

in the Eastern Mediterranean Region (2020–2024) (EM/RC66/R.5; approved Oct 2019)

EMR countries committed to the *integrated multi-concept approach* for institutional capacity and action for use of evidence in health-policy making

Requirement of the integrated multi-concept approach:

- **1.** Internal programmatic coherence within each key program, avoiding duplications
- 2. Systematic links between the key programs





#### Academic institutional capacity for EIPM: WHO guidance

The Regional Action Plan provides key guidance under:

**Strategy 1.** Enhance demand and advocacy for evidence-informed policy-making **Strategy 2.** Enhance decision-making structures and processes for use of evidence at national level

**Strategy 3.** Enhance resources for evidence-informed policy-making

Source: Regional action plan for the implementation of the framework for action to improve national institutional capacity for the use of evidence in health policy-making in the Eastern Mediterranean Region (2020–2024)

Capacity Building for Development of Policy Briefs: Advanced Training of Trainers Workshop for Researchers and Policy-Developers

29-30 March 2022 Cairo, Egypt



**Regional action plan** 

for the implementation of the framework for action to improve national institutional capacity for the use of evidence in health policy-making in the Eastern Mediterranean Region



# Why using cost analyses and economic evaluation studies in a policy brief?

Cost analyses can provide:

- Information on cost (overall or unit cost) of the intervention/policy
- Evidence on sustainability or affordability of the policy
- Information to complement economic studies conducted in other settings to the country context

#### **Economic evaluation** studies are

- Tools to assist in selecting preferred interventions or policies noting that resources are limited, and that different interventions result in different consequences
- They help in selecting the interventions that provide lowest opportunity cost
  - Among potential options



# Key requirements of an economic evaluation study

An economic evaluation study is a comparative analysis of alternative interventions or policies in terms of their costs and health consequences



Capacity Building for Development of Policy Briefs: Advanced Training of Trainers Workshop for Researchers and Policy-Developers



### Typology of the studies

- Cost analyses
- Individual economic evaluation studies
  - Cost minimization studies
  - Cost effectiveness studies •
  - Cost utility studies

for Researchers and Policy-Developers

- Cost benefit studies •
- Systematic reviews and or modeling of economic evaluation studies or ۲ cost data
  - Using rely on more than one study and sources of data
- Health Technology Assessment (HTA) studies •
  - Include assessment of effectiveness, cost-effectiveness, acceptability and equity consideration

# Main steps in conduct of an economic evaluation

- Specify the question, and baseline comparison group
- Specify the viewpoint, type and coverage of economic study
- Specify key variables to estimate cost and outcomes (effectiveness)
  - Measure differences in quantities of resource use and value them
- Specify the method to value health outcomes
  - Measure outcomes and value them (e.g. morbidity, death, QALY)
- Consider sensitivity analysis



#### Example 1 - a key policy question You are tasked with developing the policy brief to help decision making

- Country A has decided to increase the number of ICU beds in the country in response to the COVID-19 pandemic and the substantial increase in need for ICU beds.
- They are considering whether to
  - increase the number of beds in already existing ICU wards (hospitals)

or

• establish new ICU wards in hospitals without such resources (to increase geographical access).

How do you collect the required cost data?

What are the main cost related variables that should be noted in making such a decision?

Capacity Building for Development of Policy Briefs: Advanced Training of Trainers Workshop for Researchers and Policy-Developers

#### Key sources of cost data

- All important costs and effects should be included Costs
  - consumables, medicines, staff time, equipment, rent, overheads
  - Broader health service e.g. doctor visits
  - Patient (& family) costs

Effects

- Important disease-specific outcomes
- Quality of life and (all-cause) mortality
- Spill-over effects; Productivity gains
- Sources of cost data
  - Published studies (ideally systematic review or cost analyses)
  - Specific sources for reference unit costs staff cost, medicines, services ...
  - Collect information locally (small surveys, expert consultation, expenditure records)
  - RCTs may not always be the best source of data for models





## Economic evaluations can be misleading *Quality appraisal is the key*

Depending on the way they have answered questions such as:

- Valuing non-market items
- Adjustments to existing market prices
- Consideration of capital costs
- Use of average cost or marginal cost

Let's discuss ICU beds example

. . .



#### Example 1 - a key policy question You are tasked with developing the policy brief to help decision making

- Country A has decided to increase the number of ICU beds in the country in response to the COVID-19 pandemic and the substantial increase in need for ICU beds.
- While developing the policy brief, you focus further on the policy  $\bullet$ problem and note that it can be rephrased as
- Country A has decided to increase the critical care capacity and access to • medical oxygen in hospitals in the country in response to the COV pandemic and the substantial increase in need for ICU beds.
- *Now you note that there are more policy options!*

What other policy options are there in response to this policy question?





### Potential policy options

- Increasing the number of beds in already existing ICU wards (hospitals)
- Establishing new ICU wards in hospitals without such resources (to increase geographical access).
- Increasing access to medical oxygen in non-ICU hospital wards

What are the additional cost and consequence variables to be measure for this policy option?

Capacity Building for Development of Policy Briefs: Advanced Training of Trainers Workshop for Researchers and Policy-Developers



29-30 March 2022 Cairo, Egypt

•

### Additional variables of interest

- Increasing access to medical oxygen in non-ICU hospital wards
  - (cost) Oxygen use
  - (capital cost) Enhancing hospital infrastructure for medical oxygen distribution
  - (consequence) Safety concerns for medical oxygen use
    - (example of accidents in countries of the region)
  - (capital cost) National capacity for medical oxygen production...
  - (other consequences) Availability of medical oxygen for other patient groups

Are there further policy options to consider?



29-30 March 2022 Cairo, Egypt

•

## Economic evaluations can be misleading *Quality appraisal is the key*

Depending on the way they have answered questions such as:

- Valuing non-market items
- Adjustments to existing market prices
- Consideration of capital costs
- Use of average cost or marginal cost
- The follow up period for costs (and consequences)
- Inclusion of unrelated healthcare (and non-health care) costs
- Consideration of shared and overhead costs, and productivity costs

## Economic evaluations can be misleading *Quality appraisal is the key*

If not adequately assessed for:

- The viewpoint of the study
  - E.g. health care system vs society
- The basic assumptions of the study
  - E.g. certain costs or consequences can be ignored
  - Weights given to different elements in modelling studies
- Variation in cost elements on proportionality of different costs
  - E.g. medicines costs (pricing dependent) or health provider cost



#### Example 2 - a key policy question You are tasked with developing the policy brief to help decision making

- It is early 2021! Country B is developing its vaccination agenda against COVID-19. There are those in the society (and in the government) who are not favorable with the vaccination program.
- You decided to develop a decision tree to analyze cost and consequences of different options to help policy makers in their decisions and advocating for the benefits of the vaccination at national level

Capacity Building for Development of Policy Briefs: Advanced Training of Trainers Workshop for Researchers and Policy-Developers



#### Example of a decision tree modeling: COVID-19 vaccination

Are there any other outcomes or options to add the decision tree?



Capacity Building for Development of Policy Briefs: Advanced Training of Trainers Workshop for Researchers and Policy-Developers



### What to add to the model?

- Option of vaccinating key target groups?
  - remember early months of 2021
- Analyzing according to age groups?
- Include waning of vaccine effect over time?
- Include emergence of new variants of concern?
- Non-health related outcomes?

•

Capacity Building for Development of Policy Briefs: Advanced Training of Trainers Workshop for Researchers and Policy-Developers



## Appraising decision models and cost-effectiveness studies – assess whether:

- All important alternatives considered?
- All important costs and effects included?
- Were the probabilities and health outcomes valid and credible?
- Were the utilities valid and credible (e.g. QALY in cost-utility studies)?
- Were the costs (resource use and prices) valid and credible?
- Was the robustness of the conclusions tested (any sensitivity study conducted)?
- Are the results applicable to your setting?



# Possible scenarios for availability of economic evaluation evidence for a policy brief

- When an evidence-based guideline is used for developing a policy brief
  - More focus on use of CEA studies
  - Applicability; and context are the focus
- When a Health Technology Assessment study is used for developing a policy brief
  - More focus on transferability and relevance of CEA findings
- When public health questions are the focus of policy brief, without prior HTA or public health guidance
  - Often CEA studies are lacking
  - Cost analyses, sustainability and acceptability issues





## Presentation of economic evaluation and cost data in a policy brief (WHO EMRO template for policy briefs, 2022)

Policy options	Policy option 1	Policy option 2	Policy option 3
Description	Description of policy option 1	Description of policy option 2	Description of policy option 3
Main advantages**	Main advantages of policy option 1	Main advantages of policy option 2	Main advantages of policy option 3
Main disadvantages**	Main disadvantages of policy option 1	Main disadvantages of policy option 2	Main disadvantages of policy option 3
Cost and feasibility of implementation	Cost and feasibility of implementation of policy option 1	Cost and feasibility of implementation of policy option 2	Cost and feasibility of implementation of policy option 3
Stakeholders' responsibilities	Stakeholders' responsibilities of policy option 1	Stakeholders' responsibilities of policy option 2	Stakeholders' responsibilities of policy option 3

As suggested Table format\* for this section could be as below:

\* Add or reduce columns depending on the number of policy options. Keep the table concise.

\*\* Consider effectiveness, cost-effectiveness, acceptability, equity implications including evidence and certainty of evidence.



#### Session content

- WHO EMRO multi-concept approach to evidence-informed policy-making
- Key principles of economic evaluation studies
- Use of economic evaluation and Health Technology Assessment studies in policy brief development
  - $\circ~$  When and how to use them critical appraisal
  - Transferability of economic evaluation results to local context
  - Use of local cost data in selecting policy interventions
- Use of national cost data for estimating cost of policy implementation
  - Sources and validity of data
  - When to use cost data

29-30 March 2022

Cairo, Egypt

• Presenting cost and cost-effectiveness data in a policy brief



23

Thank you

Arash Rashidian, MD PhD Director of Science, Information and Dissemination

Capacity Building for Development of Policy Briefs: Advanced Training of Trainers Workshop for Researchers and Policy-Developers

